Cochrane Handbook for Systematic Reviews of Interventions

Cochrane Book Series

Edited by
Julian PT Higgins and Sally Green
Contents

Preface xiii
Acknowledgements xv
The Handbook editors xvii
Major contributors xix

Part 1 COCHRANE REVIEWS 1

1 Introduction 3
Sally Green, Julian PT Higgins, Philip Alderson, Mike Clarke, Cynthia D Malrow and Andrew D Oxman
1.1 The Cochrane Collaboration 3
1.2 Systematic reviews 6
1.3 About this Handbook 7
1.4 Contributors to the Handbook 8
1.5 Chapter information 9
1.6 References 9

2 Preparing a Cochrane review 11
Edited by Sally Green and Julian PT Higgins
2.1 Rationale for protocols 11
2.2 Format of a Cochrane review 12
2.3 Logistics of doing a review 13
2.4 Publication of Cochrane reviews in print journals and books 24
2.5 Publication of previously published reviews as Cochrane reviews 26
2.6 Declaration of interest and commercial sponsorship 26
2.7 Chapter information 29
2.8 References 29

3 Maintaining reviews: updates, amendments and feedback 31
Julian PT Higgins, Sally Green and Rob JPM Scholten
3.1 Introduction 31
3.2 Some important definitions 32
CONTENTS

3.3 Important dates associated with Cochrane reviews 39
3.4 Considerations when updating a Cochrane review 42
3.5 ‘What’s new’ and History tables 46
3.6 Incorporating and addressing feedback in a Cochrane review 48
3.7 Chapter information 48
3.8 References 49

4 Guide to the contents of a Cochrane protocol and review 51
Edited by Julian PT Higgins and Sally Green

4.1 Introduction 52
4.2 Title and review information (or protocol information) 52
4.3 Abstract 55
4.4 Plain language summary 55
4.5 Main text 55
4.6 Tables 70
4.7 Studies and references 72
4.8 Data and analyses 74
4.9 Figures 76
4.10 Sources of support to the review 77
4.11 Feedback 77
4.12 Appendices 78
4.13 Chapter information 78
4.14 References 78

Part 2 GENERAL METHODS FOR COCHRANE REVIEWS 81

5 Defining the review question and developing criteria for including studies 83
Edited by Denise O’Connor, Sally Green and Julian PT Higgins

5.1 Questions and eligibility criteria 84
5.2 Defining types of participants: which people and populations? 85
5.3 Defining types of interventions: which comparisons to make? 86
5.4 Defining types of outcomes: which outcome measures are most important? 87
5.5 Defining types of study 90
5.6 Defining the scope of a review question (broad versus narrow) 91
5.7 Changing review questions 93
5.8 Chapter information 93
5.9 References 94

6 Searching for studies 95
Carol Lefebvre, Eric Manheimer and Julie Glanville on behalf of the Cochrane Information Retrieval Methods Group

6.1 Introduction 96
6.2 Sources to search 98
6.3 Planning the search process 118
6.4 Designing search strategies 128
6.5 Managing references 142
CONTENTS

6.6 Documenting and reporting the search process 144
6.7 Chapter information 146
6.8 References 147

7 Selecting studies and collecting data 151
Edited by Julian PT Higgins and Jonathan J Deeks

7.1 Introduction 151
7.2 Selecting studies 152
7.3 What data to collect 156
7.4 Sources of data 163
7.5 Data collection forms 164
7.6 Extracting data from reports 167
7.7 Extracting study results and converting to the desired format 170
7.8 Managing data 182
7.9 Chapter information 183
7.10 References 183

8 Assessing risk of bias in included studies 187
Edited by Julian PT Higgins and Douglas G Altman on behalf of the Cochrane Statistical Methods Group and the Cochrane Bias Methods Group

8.1 Introduction 188
8.2 What is bias? 188
8.3 Tools for assessing quality and risk of bias 190
8.4 Introduction to sources of bias in clinical trials 193
8.5 The Cochrane Collaboration’s tool for assessing risk of bias 194
8.6 Presentation of assessments of risk of bias 202
8.7 Summary assessments of risk of bias 202
8.8 Incorporating assessments into analyses 206
8.9 Sequence generation 210
8.10 Allocation sequence concealment 214
8.11 Blinding of participants, personnel and outcome assessors 217
8.12 Incomplete outcome data 219
8.13 Selective outcome reporting 226
8.14 Other potential threats to validity 230
8.15 Chapter information 234
8.16 References 235

9 Analysing data and undertaking meta-analyses 243
Edited by Jonathan J Deeks, Julian PT Higgins and Douglas G Altman on behalf of the Cochrane Statistical Methods Group

9.1 Introduction 244
9.2 Types of data and effect measures 249
9.3 Study designs and identifying the unit of analysis 260
9.4 Summarizing effects across studies 263
9.5 Heterogeneity 276
9.6 Investigating heterogeneity 282
9.7 Sensitivity analyses 289
9.8 Chapter information 292
9.9 References 293
CONTENTS

10 Addressing reporting biases
Edited by Jonathan AC Sterne, Matthias Egger and David Moher on behalf of the Cochrane Bias Methods Group

10.1 Introduction 298
10.2 Types of reporting biases and the supporting evidence 299
10.3 Avoiding reporting biases 308
10.4 Detecting reporting biases 310
10.5 Chapter information 324
10.6 References 325

11 Presenting results and ‘Summary of findings’ tables
Holger J Schünemann, Andrew D Oxman, Julian PT Higgins, Gunn E Vist, Paul Glasziou and Gordon H Guyatt on behalf of the Cochrane Applicability and Recommendations Methods Group and the Cochrane Statistical Methods Group

11.1 Introduction 335
11.2 ‘Characteristics of included studies’ tables 336
11.3 Data and analyses 337
11.4 Figures 341
11.5 ‘Summary of findings’ tables 342
11.6 Additional tables 350
11.7 Presenting results in the text 351
11.8 Writing an abstract 352
11.9 Writing a plain language summary 355
11.10 Chapter information 356
11.11 References 357

12 Interpreting results and drawing conclusions
Holger J Schünemann, Andrew D Oxman, Julian PT Higgins, Jonathan J Deeks, Paul Glasziou and Gordon H Guyatt on behalf of the Cochrane Applicability and Recommendations Methods Group

12.1 Introduction 360
12.2 Assessing the quality of a body of evidence 361
12.3 Issues in applicability 367
12.4 Interpreting results of statistical analyses 369
12.5 Interpreting results from dichotomous outcomes (including numbers needed to treat) 372
12.6 Interpreting results from continuous outcomes (including standardized mean differences) 377
12.7 Drawing conclusions 380
12.8 Chapter information 382
12.9 References 383

Part 3 SPECIAL TOPICS

13 Including non-randomized studies
Barnaby C Reeves, Jonathan J Deeks, Julian PT Higgins and George A Wells on behalf of the Cochrane Non-Randomised Studies Methods Group

13.1 Introduction 392
13.2 Developing criteria for including non-randomised studies 396
CONTENTS

17 Patient-reported outcomes 531
Donald L Patrick, Gordon H Guyatt and Catherine Acquadro on behalf of the Cochrane Patient Reported Outcomes Methods Group

17.1 What are patient-reported outcomes? 532
17.2 Patient-reported outcomes and Cochrane reviews 533
17.3 Health status and quality of life as PRO outcomes 534
17.4 Issues in the measurement of patient-reported outcomes 537
17.5 Locating and selecting studies with patient-reported outcomes 538
17.6 Assessing and describing patient-reported outcomes 539
17.7 Comparability of different patient-reported outcome measures 540
17.8 Interpreting results 541
17.9 Chapter information 543
17.10 References 544

18 Reviews of individual patient data 547
Lesley A Stewart, Jayne F Tierney and Mike Clarke on behalf of the Cochrane Individual Patient Data Meta-analysis Methods Group

18.1 Introduction 548
18.2 The collaborative nature of IPD meta-analyses 550
18.3 Dealing with data 551
18.4 Analysis 553
18.5 Limitations and caveats 555
18.6 Chapter information 556
18.7 References 557

19 Prospective meta-analysis 559
Davina Ghersi, Jesse Berlin and Lisa Askie on behalf of the Cochrane Prospective Meta-analysis Methods Group

19.1 Introduction 559
19.2 The collaborative nature of prospective meta-analyses 562
19.3 The prospective meta-analysis protocol 563
19.4 Data collection in prospective meta-analysis 566
19.5 Analysis issues in prospective meta-analysis 567
19.6 Chapter information 569
19.7 References 569

20 Qualitative research and Cochrane reviews 571
Jane Noyes, Jennie Popay, Alan Pearson, Karin Hannes and Andrew Booth on behalf of the Cochrane Qualitative Research Methods Group

20.1 Introduction 572
20.2 Incorporating evidence from qualitative research in Cochrane Intervention reviews: concepts and issues 572
20.3 Qualitative evidence synthesis 576
20.4 Chapter information 583
20.5 References 584
20.6 Further selected reading 587
CONTENTS

21  Reviews in public health and health promotion  593
    Edited by Rebecca Armstrong, Elizabeth Waters and Jodie Doyle
    21.1 Introduction  593
    21.2 Study designs to include  594
    21.3 Searching  594
    21.4 Assessment of study quality and risk of bias  595
    21.5 Ethics and inequalities  597
    21.6 Context  599
    21.7 Sustainability  600
    21.8 Applicability and transferability  601
    21.9 Chapter information  603
    21.10 References  603

22  Overviews of reviews  607
    Lorne A Becker and Andrew D Oxman
    22.1 Introduction  607
    22.2 Preparing a Cochrane Overview of reviews  608
    22.3 Format of a Cochrane Overview  613
    22.4 Chapter information  631
    22.5 References  631

Index  633
Preface

The Cochrane Handbook for Systematic Reviews of Interventions (the Handbook) provides guidance to authors for the preparation of Cochrane Intervention reviews (including Cochrane Overviews of reviews). The Handbook is a long-standing document and is updated regularly to reflect advances in systematic review methodology and in response to feedback from users. This book coincides with version 5.0.1 of the online publication of the Handbook.

Keeping up to date

Please refer to the following web site for the most recent version, for interim updates to the guidance and for details of previous versions of the Handbook.

www.cochrane.org/resources/handbook

Users of the Handbook are encouraged to send feedback and corrections to the Handbook editors; contact details are available on the web site.

Central sources of support

Present sources of support

The Cochrane Collaboration

Medical Research Council, United Kingdom

Department of Health and Ageing, Australia

Monash University, Australia
Previous sources of support

National Health Service Research and Development Programme, United Kingdom

Health Research Board, Ireland

National Institute of Public Health, Norway

Copenhagen Hospital Corporation, Denmark

Health Services Research and Development Service and the University of Texas Health Science Center, San Antonio, USA

US Veterans Health Administration, USA

Oxford Regional Health Authority, UK

Nuffield Provincial Hospitals Trust, UK

LW Frohlich Fund, USA

Norwegian Ministry of Health and Social Affairs, Norway

Norwegian Research Council, Norway

Glaxo Wellcome, Norway
Acknowledgements

We are grateful to all past and current members of the Handbook Advisory Group for discussions and feedback, and would particularly like to thank Doug Altman, Chris Cates, Mike Clarke, Jon Deeks, Donna Gillies, Andrew Herxheimer, Harriet MacLehose, Philippa Middleton, Ruth Mitchell, David Moher, Donald Patrick, Ian Shemilt, Lesley Stewart, Jessica Thomas, Jane Tierney and Danielle Wheeler.

Many contributed constructive and timely peer review. We thank Phil Alderson, Claire Allen, Judith Anzures, Chris Cates, Jonathan Craig, Miranda Cumpston, Chris Del Mar, Kay Dickersin, Christian Gluud, Peter Gøtzsche, Frans Helmerhorst, Jini Hetherington, Sophie Hill, Sally Hopewell, Steve McDonald, David Moher, Ann Møller, Duncan Mortimer, Karen New, Denise O’Connor, Jordi Pardo, Rob Scholten, Simon Thompson, Jan Vandenbroucke, Janet Wale, Phil Wiffen, Hywel Williams, Paula Williamson, Jim Wright and Diana Wyatt.

Specific administrative support for this version of the Handbook was provided by Jane Lane. In addition, skilled and generous administrative and technical support provided by Claire Allen, Dave Booker, Jini Hetherington, Monica Kjeldstrøm, Cindy Manukonga, Rasmus Moustgaard, Jane Predl and Jacob Riis has contributed greatly to the preparation and co-ordination of this Handbook. We would like to thank Lucy Sayer, Fiona Woods, Laura Mellor and Jon Peacock at Wiley-Blackwell for their patience, support and advice, and also Neil Manley for providing an index and Wendy Langford for proof-reading.

This major revision of the Handbook would not have been possible without the generous support provided to the editors by colleagues at the MRC Biostatistics Unit and the Institute of Public Health in Cambridge, UK and at the Australasian Cochrane Centre, Monash University, Australia.
The *Handbook* editors

Julian Higgins is a Senior Statistician at the MRC Biostatistics Unit, Institute of Public Health, University of Cambridge and a Visiting Fellow at the UK Cochrane Centre, Oxford, UK.

Sally Green is a Professorial Fellow at the Institute of Health Services Research at Monash University, Melbourne, Australia and Director of the Australasian Cochrane Centre.
Major contributors

**Acquadro, Catherine**
MAPI Research Institute, Lyon, France

**Alderson, Philip**
National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence, London/Manchester, United Kingdom

**Altman, Douglas G**
Centre for Statistics in Medicine, University of Oxford, Oxford, United Kingdom

**Armstrong, Rebecca**
The McCaughey Centre: VicHealth Centre for the Promotion of Mental Health and Community Wellbeing, University of Melbourne, Melbourne, Australia

**Askie, Lisa M**
NHMRC Clinical Trials Centre, University of Sydney, Camperdown, Australia

**Becker, Lorne A**
Department of Family Medicine, SUNY Upstate Medical University, Syracuse, NY, United States of America

**Berlin, Jesse A**
Pharmacoepidemiology, Johnson & Johnson Pharmaceutical Research and Development Titusville, NJ, USA

**Booth, Andrew**
School of Health and Related Research, University of Sheffield, Sheffield, United Kingdom

**Byford, Sarah**
Centre for the Economics of Mental Health, Institute of Psychiatry, King’s College, London, United Kingdom

**Clarke, Mike**
UK Cochrane Centre, National Institute for Health Research, Oxford, United Kingdom

**Deeks, Jonathan J**
Department of Public Health and Epidemiology, University of Birmingham, Birmingham, United Kingdom

**Doyle, Jodie**
The McCaughey Centre: VicHealth Centre for the Promotion of Mental Health and Community Wellbeing, University of Melbourne, Melbourne, Australia

**Drummond, Michael**
Centre for Health Economics, University of York, York, United Kingdom

**Egger, Matthias**
Institute of Social and Preventive Medicine, University of Bern, Bern, Switzerland

**Eisenstein, Eric**
Duke Clinical Research Center, Duke University, Durham, NC, United States of America

**Ghersi, Davina**
Department of Research Policy and Cooperation, World Health Organization, Geneva, Switzerland
MAJOR CONTRIBUTORS

Glanville, Julie
Centre for Reviews and Dissemination, University of York, York, United Kingdom

Glasziou, Paul P
Department of Primary Health Care, University of Oxford, Oxford, United Kingdom

Green, Sally
Australasian Cochrane Centre, Monash University, Melbourne, Australia

Guyatt, Gordon H
Departments of Clinical Epidemiology and Biostatics, McMaster University, Ontario, Canada

Hannes, Karin
Belgian Centre for Evidence-Based Medicine, Leuven, Belgium

Herxheimer, Andrew
Co-founder, DIPEx; Emeritus Fellow, UK Cochrane Centre, London, United Kingdom

Higgins, Julian PT
MRC Biostatistics Unit, Cambridge, United Kingdom

Knapp, Martin
Institute of Psychiatry, King’s College London, and London School of Economics, London, United Kingdom

Lefebvre, Carol
UK Cochrane Centre, National Institute for Health Research, Oxford, United Kingdom

Loke, Yoon K
School of Medicine, Health Policy and Practice, University of East Anglia, Norwich, United Kingdom

Mallender, Jacqueline
Matrix Knowledge Group Ltd., London, United Kingdom

Manheimer, Eric
Center for Integrative Medicine, University of Maryland School of Medicine, Baltimore, MA, United States of America

McDaid, David
Personal Social Services Research Unit, London School of Economics and Political Science, London, United Kingdom

Moher, David
Chalmers Research Group, Children’s Hospital of Eastern Ontario Research Institute; Department of Epidemiology and Community Medicine, University of Ottawa, Ottawa, Canada

Mugford, Miranda
Health Economics Group, School of Medicine, Health Policy and Practice, University of East Anglia, Norwich, United Kingdom

Noyes, Jane
Centre for Health-Related Research, School of Healthcare Sciences, Bangor University, Bangor, Wales, United Kingdom

O’Connor, Denise
Australasian Cochrane Centre, Monash University, Melbourne, Australia

Oxman, Andrew D
Preventive and International Health Care Unit, Norwegian Knowledge Centre for the Health Services, Oslo, Norway

Patrick, Donald L
Department of Health Services and Seattle Quality of Life Group, University of Washington, Seattle, WA, United States of America

Pearson, Alan
Joanna Briggs Institute, University of Adelaide, Adelaide, Australia
MAJOR CONTRIBUTORS

Popay, Jennie
Institute for Health Research, Lancaster University, Lancaster, United Kingdom

Price, Deirdre
Department of Clinical Pharmacology, University of Oxford, Oxford, United Kingdom

Reeves, Barnaby
Bristol Heart Institute, University of Bristol, Bristol, United Kingdom

Scholten, Rob
Dutch Cochrane Centre, Academic Medical Center, Amsterdam, The Netherlands

Schünemann, Holger J
INFORMA/CLARITY Research/Department of Epidemiology, National Cancer Institute Regina Elena, Rome, Italy

Shemilt, Ian
Health Economics Group, School of Medicine, Health Policy and Practice, University of East Anglia, Norwich, United Kingdom

Sterne, Jonathan AC
Department of Social Medicine, University of Bristol, Bristol, United Kingdom

Stewart, Lesley A
Centre for Reviews and Dissemination, University of York, York, United Kingdom

Tierney, Jayne F
MRC Clinical Trials Unit, London, United Kingdom

Vale, Luke
Health Economics Research Unit, University of Aberdeen, Aberdeen, United Kingdom

Vist, Gunn E
Preventive and International Health Care Unit, Norwegian Knowledge Centre for the Health Services, Oslo, Norway

Walker, Damian
Health Systems Program, Department of International Health, Johns Hopkins Bloomberg School of Public Health, Baltimore, MA, United States of America

Waters, Elizabeth
The McCaughey Centre: VicHealth Centre for the Promotion of Mental Health and Community Wellbeing, University of Melbourne, Melbourne, Australia

Wells, George A
Department of Epidemiology and Community Medicine, University of Ottawa, Ottawa, Ontario, Canada